Bagdad Architectural Advisory Committee Minutes of the April 27, 2005 Meeting

The meeting was called to order at 8:35a.m.with the following members and staff present: Mrs. Jan Davis, Committee Member; Mr. Michael Johnson, Committee Member, Mr. David Bailly, Committee Member, Mr. Joshua Wilks, Committee Member, Dr. Charles D'Asaro, Committee Member, Mrs. Karin Heaton, Committee Advisor, and Kacey Wagg, staff to the Committee.

The minutes of the March 23, 2005 meeting were approved with one minor correction to show that Dr. D'Asaro requested Robert's Rules of Order be used.

The first item on the agenda was case 2005-BHAAB-006, a request by Tony & Elizabeth Coogle for repairs to their home and a screen pool enclosure addition. Ms. Wagg gave a brief introduction and Mr. Coogle presented an example of the porch railing and further explained his requests. Board members questioned Mr. Coogle on his setbacks and the ability to see the pool enclosure from the street. The Board members agreed that the enclosure should be screened to protect the ambiance of the district from public rights of way. Mrs. Davis moved to allow the enclosure with a privacy fence or landscaping to hide the enclosure from the side streets and main street frontage. Mr. Wilks seconded and the approval was unanimous. Mrs. Davis also moved to approve all requests for repair and the alterations to allow French doors to access the pool. Mr. Bailly seconded this motion and the vote was again unanimous. Mr. Coogle accepted the Boards decision.

Following this discussion, Dr. D'Asaro suggested that the Land Development Code additions and changes prohibit above ground pools in the Historic District. The Board generally agreed and staff will make a note to include in the changes when the Board takes them up again.

The second item on the agenda was case 2005-BHAAB-007, a request by Mr. Adrian Cato to demolish an existing structure, tree removal and approval of new architectural plans. Ms. Wagg briefly described the requests and introduced Mr. Cato. The Board first took up the request for demolition. Dr. D'Asaro asked if the structure under consideration was on the original list of homes submitted for national register designation. Ms. Wagg explained that the charge of the Board was to determine if the structure was contributing to the character of the district, regardless of whether it was on the original list. Mrs. Davis referred to We Remember Bagdad: An Architectural History and informed the Board that the home was not listed as a contributing structure in that book. Mr. Johnson moved to permit the home to be demolished and Mrs. Davis seconded. The motion passed unanimously. Mr. Cato accepted the Board's decision on this item.

The Board then took up the question of tree removal. Mr. Cato explained the reasoning for taking the trees down. Two of the trees are in the footprint of the structure and one is directly adjacent to it. One is rotten and one is leaning toward the house. Three oaks and two pecans are requested to be removed. The Board discussed with Mr. Cato his plans for replanting trees on the property. Mr. Cato indicated he would be willing to do so. Mr. Wilks moved approval of the tree removal requests with the stipulation that a sand live oak tree would be planted on the property to replace one of the pecan trees. Mr. Johnson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

Mr. Cato accepted the Board's decision on this item.

The Board then discussed the architectural plans for the replacement structure. There had been some brief discussion initially when the item was presented and Mr. Cato had indicated they chose a plan with a 6' wide front porch and steep roof pitch in an effort to fit in with the historic architecture of the area. He also pointed out the long front windows. Dr. D'Asaro asked about the veneer and Mr. Cato said that it would be brick with some vinyl. There was discussion between Mr. Cato and Mr. Johnson about hardiplank. Mr. Johnson explained that it weathered much better and required much less maintenance than wood. When discussion resumed after approval of the first two requests, Mr. Wilks expressed his concern about the brick veneer and there was general agreement among the members that it was not appropriate—it would not fit in with the architectural character of the district, especially since the home is in such close proximity to important structures like the Methodist Church and so close to Forsyth, the main thoroughfare.

Karin Heaton advised the Board that brick was not the only concern, though. The design of the home, she explained, is very contemporary. She suggested that moving the garage back, creating a flush front with a porch all the way across the front would help. The members agreed that this would mimic a Creole Cottage style home, which is typical of the district. A side entry garage would be required and there was discussion by Mr. Bailly and Mr. Johnson of the cost of this versus losing the cost of the gable front roof. There was significant discussion about the style of the home, the veneer and the importance of the home's location in the district. The Board made a number of specific design suggestions and Mr. Cato explained his concerns. Mr. Wilks made a motion requesting Mr. Cato go to his builder to determine what adjustments can be made to create a flush front home mimicking a Creole Cottage with a side entrance garage and with hardiplank veneer. Mr. Johnson seconded. One member abstained from the vote, all others voted in favor. Dr. D'Asaro mentioned that the Board can meet mid-month if needed to review requests. Ms. Wagg reminded the Board that this would only be an option if the members could be convened and if staff time allowed for a mid-month meeting. Mr. Cato indicated that he did not agree with the Board's suggestions.

The Board discussed two items regarding changes to homes. One was determined to be outside the district, the other, next door to 4617 Forsyth, staff will investigate. The Board members once again strongly reiterated that work should begin again on the Land Development Code changes. Staff agreed and said that the only issue was staff workload.

The next regular meeting of the BHAAB will be at 8:30a.m.on Wednesday May 25, 2005.

The meeting was adjourned at approximately 10:45a.m.